Date: 9/5/2021  Reported By: Bob Luce
Contact Email: bobj-traveler@yahoo.com  7:24 AM

Describe Observation:

Upper Escalante Wash between Moson Road and Escalante Road.

Observed 5 head of cattle including 3 steers.

All of the cattle: Long-horned steers. Lots of hoof prints. Numerous cattle tracks & trails.
Bella Vista Ranch cattle.

GEOSPATIAL INFORMATION
Latitude: 31.59382  Longitude: 110.18382
WGS 84 UTM 12R
Easting:  Northing:

Additional Notes - Sketch

Photos? YES  NO
Fourteen (14) examples of inadequate and nonfunctional SPRNCA eastern boundary fence lines, from between Hereford and SR90. Photos taken September 14, 2021.


Four (4) additional examples of inadequate fencing surrounding a private parcel within the SPRNCA boundary, immediately south of the Hereford bridge. Photos taken September 13, 2021.
Lastly, the terminal southern SPRNCA boundary, bordering another private parcel, contained no functional fence line through the majority of the riparian zone. Photos taken September 14, 2021.

From a Center for Biological Diversity member:

At least 8 cows on river 10/30/21 about 1 mi South of Hwy 82, 12 R 577114 m E 3508448

One black bull, one black calf, 6 cows (one brown, tow white and remainder black:}
We filed a Notice of Intent to Sue on July 9, 2021 hoping to force Arizona State Director Ray Suazo and SPRNCA Manager Scott Feldhausen to do their jobs by ending the trespass grazing causing the extinction of an endangered species, [https://www.biologicaldiversity.org/programs/public_lands/grazing/pdfs/NOI-20210709-SPRNCA-TRESPASS-GRAZING.pdf](https://www.biologicaldiversity.org/programs/public_lands/grazing/pdfs/NOI-20210709-SPRNCA-TRESPASS-GRAZING.pdf).


On September 22, 2021, referring to his fear of violence by local ranchers if he were to order and proceed with a roundup of trespass cows damaging SPRNCA and causing the extinction, Feldhausen said that he was “never again putting his staff in such a situation.” [https://www.myheraldreview.com/news/cochise_county/cbd-maricopa-audubon-file-suit-against-blm-management-of-sprnca/article_86e39594-27b0-11ec-921d-5371a77c4a86.html](https://www.myheraldreview.com/news/cochise_county/cbd-maricopa-audubon-file-suit-against-blm-management-of-sprnca/article_86e39594-27b0-11ec-921d-5371a77c4a86.html).


This morning, November 1, 2021, a Center member again documented fresh cow sign North of the Hereford Bridge:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Good morning Eric, Scott, and all,

I'm writing to report eight (maybe more) unauthorized cattle in the San Pedro Riparian NCA in theriparian area south of Charleston Bridge (and Charleston Road).

The photos (two attached) and video (follow this link) show unauthorized cattle (six in the photo, and eight in the video), as well as a very blurry photo of the ear tag color, which is a minty bright green. The animals' variations in color, and the green ear tag color, should make them easy for a rancher to identify.

Please notify all area ranchers and give them a firm deadline for removal. If that deadline isn't met, please enact the BLM's unauthorized cattle removal procedure to remedy this, in the most humane way possible.

If it is dangerous to do so---with potential gun violence from the ranchers as Scott Feldhausen had indicated in our September 22nd SPRNCA Collaborative Adaptive Management Annual Meeting---please work with officials up the line to ensure a safe effective procedure.

Naturally, although your staff is stretched thin, all fence repair needed will hopefully be addressed asap. For those of you who don't frequent the river, you'd be amazed at how much damage to fragile river banks and surrounds even in 24 hours of unauthorized grazing.

We can't let our country be ruled by rancher citizens with guns, so I hope that all means will be used, all the way up to the highest authorities, to nip this stressful situation in the bud.

Thank you for your efforts in protecting this globally important migratory corridor and habitat for endangered plants and animals, as well as the citizens who cherish it.

Sincerely,
Lizann Michaud
520-249-9071
PO Box 593
Bisbee, AZ
85603
At least ten cows north of the Charleston Bridge on November 6, 2021:
GPS POINTS FROM SOUTH TO NORTH: 31.635268 -110.175242 TO 1.635268 -110.175242
At least ten cows north of the Charleston Bridge on November 6, 2021:
GPS POINTS FROM SOUTH TO NORTH: 31.635268 -110.175242 TO 1.635268 -110.175242
SIX OR MORE COWS BETWEEN THE HEREFORD BRIDGE AND HIGHWAY 90 AT THE CONFLUENCE OF MILLER WASH AND THE SAN PEDRO RIVER (12 R 0582949 E 3485841)
A HERD OF TRESPASS COWS SOUTH OF THE CHARLESTON BRIDGE ON NOVEMBER 20, 2021 (GPS 578421 x 3499058 S)
Hi Mr. Suazo and Mr. Feldhausen,

I was visiting the SPRNCA on Saturday to enjoy a hike and was really hoping I wouldn't see cows or signs of livestock trespass on my day off, but I did see some pretty recent livestock (maybe a day old?) sign in the San Pedro River. As I've been getting copies of the reports Mr. Silver has been sending, I figured I should go ahead and use his trespass report numbering system, so here is report #24. It is a big file, so I think you will get a link. Please let me know if you need this sent as separate PDFs/smaller files.

I hiked from Fairbanks down to the historic site at Boquillas Ranch so all of these locations are between those points. I've attached a pdf with a map, locations, and photos. Please let me know if you have any questions about this information and I do hope that you can get a handle on these trespass or unauthorized livestock sometime soon.

Cyndi Tuell
Arizona & New Mexico Director
Western Watersheds Project
738 N. 5th Ave, Suite 206
Tucson, AZ 85705
cyndi@westernwatersheds.org
www.westernwatersheds.org
520-272-2454
Pronouns: She/Her/Hers

CTuell SPRNCA Trespass Report 24_2021.pdf
TRESPASS COWS ABOUT ONE MILE NORTH OF THE HEREFORD BRIDGE NOVEMBER 28, 2021 (GPS 12 R 0584716/3479068)
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
RE: COMPLAINT #26 2021-21 REGARDING SPRNCA TRESPASS COWS OR UNMAINTAINED FENCING

TRESPASS COWS ABOUT ONE MILE SOUTH OF FAIRBANK (GPS 12 R 0576694/3509169) TO UP THE BABOCOMARI RIVER
DECEMBER 4, 2021
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Good afternoon, Eric, Scott, and all,

I'm writing to report fresh evidence of "unauthorized grazing" in the SPRNCA, just north of the river's intersection with Escapule wash on the river banks and in the river bed. Please see GPS photos in this Dropbox folder: https://www.dropbox.com/sh/ch9e3659iaz3d95/AACc1IHRLecdSGxSXWwdyogfa?dl=0 I attached one of the photos to this email in case the folder is difficult to access.

Thank you,
Lizann

Lizann Michaud
520-249-9071
PO Box 593
Bisbee, AZ
85603
TRESPASS COWS NORTH OF CHARLESTON ON JANUARY 14, 2022  42 R 0577860/3499943
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
COMPLAINT #28 2020-22 REGARDING SPRNCA TRESPASS COWS OR UNMAINTAINED FENCING

TRESPASS COWS JANUARY 16, 2022 BY GRAVEYARD WASH 12 R 0577188/3499683:

WATER GAP DOWN GRAVEYARD WASH JANUARY 16, 2022 12 R 0576810/3499617:
COW TRACKS GRAVEYARD GULCH JANUARY 16, 2022:
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Robin Silver

From: Robin Silver <rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org>
Sent: Wednesday, February 16, 2022 12:25 AM
To: Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov); Scott Feldhausen (afeldhausen@blm.gov); Nada Culver (nculver@blm.gov); Deb Haaland (exsec@ios.doi.gov)
Subject: COMPLAINT #29 2020-22 REGARDING SPRNCA TRESPASS COWS OR UNMAINTAINED FENCING
TRESPASS COWS FEBRUARY 11, 2022, St. David Cienega:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
TREPASS COWS FEBRUARY 2-, 2022: Graveyard Gulch 12R 577292E/3499873N
TREPASS COWS FEBRUARY 27, 2022: SOUTH OF ESCAPULE 12R 0581024/3494280
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
TREPASS COWS MARCH 23, 2022: NORTH OF ESCAPULE 31 36 362N 110 9 526W
TRESPASS COWS MARCH 28, 2022: NORTH OF CHARLESTON ROAD 12 R 057759 / 3499951
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
TRESPASS COWS APRIL 1, 2022: BOQUILLAS AREA 12 R 0577475 / 3507078
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Robin Silver

From: Robin Silver <rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org>
Sent: Sunday, April 10, 2022 11:21 PM
To: Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov); Scott Feldhausen (afeldhausen@blm.gov); Nada Culver (nculver@blm.gov); Deb Haaland (exsec@ios.doi.gov)
Subject: COMPLAINT #35 2020-22 REGARDING SPRNCA TRESPASS COWS OR UNMAINTAINED FENCING

TRESPASS COWS APRIL 8, 2022, South of the Charleston Road 12 R 0578928/3498642:
North of Charleston Road, 4/9/22 @ 31.64187, -110.17889:
North of Charleston Road, 4/9/22 @ 31.64341, -110.17943:
North of Charleston Road, 4/9/22 @ 31.64334, -110.17929:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
St. David Cienega, 4/27/22 @ North of Charleston Road, 4/9/22 @ 12 R 0573501/3523206:
From: Robin Silver <rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org>
Sent: Sunday, May 1, 2022 5:12 PM
To: Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov); Scott Feldhausen (afeldhausen@blm.gov); Nada Culver (nculver@blm.gov); Deb Haaland (exsec@ios.doi.gov)
Cc: John Martin (john.h.martin@usdoj.gov)
Subject: COMPLAINT #38 2020-22 REGARDING SPRNCA TRESPASS COWS OR UNMAINTAINED FENCING

North of the Hereford Bridge, in the heart of Huachuca Water Umbel occupied habitat, 4/30, 22 @ 12 R 0584718/3479077:
BULL IN CENTER OF IMAGE:
South of the Hereford bridge, 5/8/22 a bull, cows and calves @ 12 R 0584829/3478361:
Must be nice to work for a federal agency like BLM, to get a federal check for doing nothing, and to know that there is no penalty for doing nothing.

Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
South of the Hereford bridge, 5/19/22 a bull, cows and calves @ 12 R 0584828/3478250:
Approximately one mile north of the Hereford bridge, 5/22/22. There is a herd of cows causing fresh damage @ 12 R 0584995/3479564. No images were captured of the cows as they are very wild and moved just to the east of the GPS mark on the River.

It is hardly even fathomable that public officials responsible for a public treasure so valuable as the SPRNCA continue to do NOTHING when the immediate area north of the Hereford Bridge is being converted from a verdant, intact location of the core and most critical population of an endangered species, the Huachuca Water, into a cowed out nuke zone. Shame on you all.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Approximately one mile north of the Charleston Bridge and continuing to about one mile further north there is extensive fresh cow sign, 5/24/22. There is a herd of cows there but only with one bull, two cows and one were clearly visualized. The bull has what looks like a “G” on its right hip and a right white ear tag.

Bulls are worth a great deal of money to ranchers. There is no way that we are documenting so many bulls in the SPRNCA without the owner ranchers knowing their cows are trespassing in the SPRNCA.

Current SPRNCA Manager Scott Feldhausen admitted publicly on September 22, 2021, that he is not rounding up SPRNCA trespass cows owing to “fear of violence by local ranchers” to his staff if he were to order and they were to proceed with a roundup. In the September 22, 2021, BLM SPRNCA Resource Management Plan Implementation Meeting, SPRNCA Manager Feldhausen said that he was “never again putting his staff in such a situation.” Mr. Feldhausen was referring to his fear of violence by local ranchers to his staff if he were to order and they were to proceed with a roundup of the trespass cattle causing so much damage to the SPRNCA.

When will the SPRNCA be protected by a BLM State Director and a SPRNCA Manager that are not fearful of violent threatening local ranchers? Does the BLM have a law enforcement branch?
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
North of the Hereford Bridge today, May 27, 2022, there are at least 27 cows (bulls, cows and calves). One of the cows looked to have a left white ear tag. GPS is 12 R 584906/3479254.

Non-native rabbit’s foot grass is now essentially the only bank cover in an area that used to be the stronghold for the endangered Huachuca Water Umbel.

Since lack of action to protect the disappearing Huachuca Water Umbel in this area has now been going on unarguably since our notification on May 10, 2020 to BLM Arizona State Director Ray Suazo and SPRNCA Manager Scott Feldhausen (See email: Email correspondence: to Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov) and Scott Feldhausen (blm_az_gdo_mailbox@blm.gov), from: Robin Silver; RE: Livestock at Hereford Bridge, throughout, May 10, 2020.), we can unequivocally conclude that Mr. Suazo’s and Mr. Feldhausen’s actions have and are now resulting in the malicious damaging and malicious destruction of an endangered plant.

USFWS Arizona State Director Heather Whitlaw is “cc”’d here with the expectation that USFWS Law Enforcement will now be requested to investigate and to stop Mr. Suazo’s and Mr. Feldhausen’s violation of 16 U.S.C. § 1538 [Prohibited acts](a)(2) which states, “with respect to any endangered species of plants...it is unlawful for any person subject to the jurisdiction of the United States to ... maliciously damage or destroy any such species on any such area.” Mr. Suazo’s and Mr. Feldhausen’s persistent allowing trespass cow grazing to damage and destroy Huachuca Water Umbel has certainly reached the level of “malicious” necessary to pursue an investigation and a prosecution for the taking of an endangered plant.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
June 1, 2022, there is a large herd of cows in a stretch of the San Pedro River approximately one to two miles south of the San Pedro House concentrated in the area between Cottonwood and Garden Washes. Fresh cow sign is plentiful. And most concerningly, THE ENDANGERED HUACHUCA WATER UMBEL THAT HAS BEEN FOUND CONSISTENTLY AT TWO SITES HERE IN THE PAST IS NOW GONE!!! And fresh cow tracks are seen in the immediate vicinity of both of these two sites.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
June 3, 2022, there are fresh tracks approximately ¾ of a mile south of the Hereford Bridge and ranging south for about another ½ mile. At a minimum, there is one bull, a cow and a calf.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
June 7, 2022, there are fresh cow tracks starting about 0.1 mile south of the Charleston Road continuing to the south for at least one mile. There is a minimum of one bull, two cows and one calf. The GPS is 12 R 0578830 / 3498751. AND THE PATCH OF ENDANGERED HUACHUCA WATER UMBEL IS GONE.
June 11, 2022, there are fresh tracks approximately ½ of a mile north of the Charleston Road continuing at least ¾ mile to the north. The GPS coordinate is: 12 R 057792/349985. At a minimum, there is one bull and one cow.
June 24, 2022, there are fresh tracks approximately 2.5 miles north of Fairbank with eaten bulrushes and cottonwood samplings and THE ENDANGERED HUACHUCA WATER UMBEL PREVIOUSLY LOCATED THERE IS NOW GONE!!! The GPS coordinate is: 12 R 0576336/3510957.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
June 23, 2022, there are more than six cows between Escapule Wash and the Charleston Bridge, GPS coordinates: N31.37.0948/W110.9.9055.
Today, September 1, 2022, at approximately 1530, a Center member documented the current presence of two cows, undoubtedly a cow and calf pair, just to the north of the St. David Cienega, GPS point 31°50’34.3”N 110°13’41.0”W. The tracks were not able to be followed to visualize the two cows owing to monsoonal growth of Johnson grass. No cow is authorized to be in this area.

Imagery of the fresh tracks:
The contact for this documentation is Robin Silver.

Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Yesterday, October 20, 2022, at 1249, a Center member documented the current presence of one cow, obviously very large, in the Escapule area, south of the Charleston Road, GPS point 31°36′14.2″N 110°09′11.3″W. No cow is authorized to be in this area.

Imagery of the fresh cow feces:
The contact for this documentation is Robin Silver.

Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Today, October 25, 2022, very fresh cow sign from multiple cows was again documented at approximately one mile north of the Hereford Bridge, GPS 12 R 0584448 / 3480126, in the same area where you have allowed cows to destroy the largest population of endangered Huachuca Water Umbel. Their urine is still wet, their feces is still fly covered:
The contact for this documentation is Robin Silver.

Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
We expect that this complaint, which fulfills all of the reporting requirements in our settlement, is included in the category requiring a mandatory response and reporting.

We consider this report as “POST SETTLEMENT TRESPASS COW COMPLAINT #4”

Yesterday, October 25, 2022, fresh track, from one or more cattle, was documented approximately a mile south of the San Pedro House, south of AZ-90, on the north bank of Kingfisher Pond and close to the river in the first wash south of San Pedro House.
WASH WITHIN RIPARIAN AREA
The contact for this documentation is Lizann Michaud.

Lizann Michaud
PO Box 593
Bisbee, AZ  85603
Email: lizann314@gmail.com
Phone: 520-249-9071
Today, November 5, 2022, at 0759 multiple cows are again documented at the Hereford Bridge on SPRNCA, GPS: LAT 31.438963 LON -110.106895. Here is a link to a video of at least nine cows: [https://vimeo.com/767648969](https://vimeo.com/767648969). And here are two stills:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, November 23, 2022, at 1023 two cows and a downed water gap are documented near Graveyard Gulch on SPRNCA. The downed water gap is at GPS: 12 R 0576716 / 3500126 with further tracks at GPS 12 R 0577051 / 3500047:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, December 19, 2022, at 1002 at least six cows, one bull and one calf, 1.5 miles north of Fairbank, just north of grand central mill on SPRNCA. The cows are observed at GPS: 12 R 0576366 / 3512418.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, this morning, December 22, 2022, at least 12 cows, 1.2 miles north of the Hereford Bridge, all black, one with a small silver tag left ear bottom, GPS reading locations of tracks: GPS: 12 R 0584796 / 3479324; 12 R 0584590 / 3480296 and 12 R 0584621 / 3480180:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Today, this morning and midday, December 23, 2022, a herd of cows are documented with widespread fresh tracks of various sizes and fresh trails in and about the St. David Cienega in SPRNCA. The gate is wide open with trail to the gate and also further to the west. Mowed gramoids are documented. Numerous cows are heard just to the west of the Cienega. GPS of first fresh tracks inside gate is: 12 R 0572986 / 3523671. The rest of the images away from this immediate area have the GPS location included in the images.
Yesterday morning, fresh tracks were documented from Hereford Bridge south for 1.5 miles with the freshest tracks just north of the Boucher private property. Extensive trailing is documented. GPS locations are included on each image.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
This morning, December 29, 2022, fresh tracks, feces and widespread damage are documented from the Highway 92 bridge at least two miles to the south mostly on the east side of the river in SPRNCA. A downed fence is also noted east of the river. GPS locations are on each image.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Wednesday morning, January 11, 2023, north of the Hereford Bridge, cows were observed and are again documented in the area where trespass cows have wiped out the largest population of endangered Huachuca Water Umbel.

31.451575, -110.109636

31.454614, -110.110751
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Friday morning, January 13, 2023, northwest of the Hereford Bridge to Hunter Wash 4 miles north of Hereford Bridge. Total of 2.5 miles with fresh cow sign and three groups of cows, one of five black cows, one of three with one red and two black, and one herd. These sightings, along the River area in the area where trespass cows have wiped out the largest population of endangered Huachuca Water Umbel.

First fresh track 1.5 miles north of the Hereford Bridge:
Much more habitat destruction with more trailing and utilization:
Utilization of seep willow:
At least five black cows:
All sizes of fresh tracks including calves:
Hunter Wash:
Three cows, one red, two black:
Streamside grass utilization:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Robin Silver

From: Robin Silver
Sent: Sunday, January 15, 2023 12:38 PM
To: BLM_TUCSON_FIELD_OFFICE (BLM_AZ_TFOWEB@blm.gov); Tracy Stone-Manning (tstonemanning@blm.gov); Nada Culver (nculver@blm.gov); Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov); Scott Feldhausen (afeildhausen@blm.gov)
Cc: 'John Martin (john.h.martin@usdoj.gov)'; 'Martha Williams'; 'Lueders, Amy L'; 'Whitlaw, Heather'; 'McIntyre, Julie'
Subject: POST SETTLEMENT TRESPASS COW COMPLAINT #14 COWS DOCUMENTED AND PHOTOGRAPHED JUST NORTH OF THE HEREFORD BRIDGE

Sunday morning, January 15, 2023, at 1100, documented just north of the Hereford Bridge, GPS 31.45039 / -110.09911. This image faces west from the old railroad tracks:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Cows in SPRNCA observed and documented at 1030 this morning, January 22, 2023, approximately 1.5 miles north of the Hereford Bridge in SPRNCA, GPS locations: 31.4615640 / -110.1084378, and, 31.4534588 / -110.1066776:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Cows in SPRNCA are observed and documented on 1/26/2023.

The cows and fresh tracks in the following four images are located at 31.834739 / 110.219480 near the St. David Cienega:
The following three images of fresh tracks are documented within the St. David Cienega, GPS: 31.838493 / 110.224726:
South of the St. David Cienega, fresh cow sign is documented at 31.824901 / 110.217447:
Continuing south, more fresh cow tracks and illegal motor vehicle traffic are documented at 31.819399 / 110.216588:
Fresh tracks and cow feces are documented at 31.818621 / 110.217698:
More fresh cow tracks are documented streamside at 31.813109 / 110.214085:
And more fresh cow tracks, motor vehicle tracks in the river bed, and COWS are documented south of St. David Cienega at 31.811163 / 110.212299:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, January 27, 2023, cows are documented on the river bank in SPRNCA near Fairbank:

GPS: 31.715429 N / 110.190896 W:
GPS 31.690296 N / 110.189607 W:
GPS 31.715429 N / 110.190896 W:
GPS 31.708571 N / 110.185811 W:
Fresh tracks, feces and damage are documented today, 2/1/23, north of the Hereford Bridge. These specific findings are all new since the recent rains. This is the area where BLM administrative inaction and malfeasance has resulted in the loss of the largest population of endangered Huachuca Water Umbel.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Cows, fresh feces, and a dead cow in the River documented today, February 2, 2023, north of Fairbank in SPRNCA:

GPS 31.7256930 / 110.1954738:
31.7439662 / 110.1969065:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Cows, fresh feces, and fresh cow tracks documented February 3, 2023 in the St. David Cienega in SPRNCA:
Dropped pin

(31.8353848, -110.2232595)

20 ft

Directions
Start
Save
La

Measure distance

853FRQPG+5M

(31.8353848, -110.2232595)
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
From: Robin Silver
Sent: Saturday, February 4, 2023 8:32 PM
To: BLM_TUCSON_FIELD_OFFICE (BLM_AZ_TFOWEB@blm.gov); Tracy Stone-Manning (tstonemanning@blm.gov); Nada Culver (nculver@blm.gov); Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov); Scott Feldhausen (afeldhausen@blm.gov)
Cc: John Martin (john.h.martin@usdoj.gov); Martha Williams (martha_williams@fws.gov); Amy Lueders (RLueders@fws.gov); Heather Whitlaw (Heather_Whitlaw@fws.gov); Julie McIntyre (julie_mcintyre@fws.gov); Deb Haaland (exsec@ios.doi.gov); Shannon Estenoz (Shannon_Estenoz@ios.doi.gov)
Subject: POST SETTLEMENT TRESPASS COW COMPLAINT #21 HERD OF COWS AND NEW DAMAGE in SPRNCA NEAR CONTENTION

Fresh cow sign, fresh feces, fresh tracks, fresh streamside damage including heavy utilization of seep willow and grasses and fresh trailing, and a herd of cows from Contention north for at least two miles. At least 11 cows are photographed. Judging from the extensive damage and tracks there are obviously many more.
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Fresh tracks and fresh feces are documented south of the San Pedro House February 5, 2023, upstream for approximately three miles:
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Dead cows, fresh cow feces and tracks fresh tracks and fresh feces are documented north of Fairbank in SPRNCA on February 7, 2023:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, February 8, 2023, fresh cow feces and tracks are documented in SPRNCA in St. David Cienega and along the San Pedro River to the south of St. David Cienega:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
February 9, 2023, we document cows, fresh feces, fresh tracks and trailing in SPRNCA north of Fairbank for several miles:

31.7845589, -110.2189016:

31.7846803, -110.2188225:
31.7825593, -110.2165630:

31.7749691, -110.2092933:

31.7749691, -110.2092933:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Saturday, February 11, 2023, fresh feces and tracks with marked cow grazing damage to perennial streamside grasses along the lower Babocomari to its confluence with the San Pedro in SRPNCA:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
On Sunday, February 12, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks in SPRNCA south of the San Pedro House:
Dropped pin
Near Sierra Vista Southeast, AZ 85615
1 min

Directions  Start  Save  Location

Measure distance

GVQ9+G45 Sierra Vista Southeast, Arizona
(31.5387567, -110.1321375)

Add a missing place
Dropped pin
Near Sierra Vista Southeast, AZ 85615
1 min

Measure distance

GVQ9+24R Sierra Vista Southeast, Arizona
(31.5376089, -110.1322455)

Add a missing place
Dropped pin
Near Sierra Vista Southeast, AZ 85615
1 min

Directions
Start
Save
La

Measure distance

GVM8+VV7 Sierra Vista Southeast, Arizona
(31.5346633, -110.1328158)

Add a missing place
Dropped pin
Near Sierra Vista Southeast, AZ 85615
วก 40 min

Directions  Start  Save  Location

Measure distance

GVFC+MW8 Sierra Vista Southeast, Arizona
(31.5241566, -110.1276837)

Add a missing place

Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
On Sunday, February 12, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks in SPRNCA north of Fairbank:
31.7455064, -110.1957119
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Today, Thursday, February 16, 2023, cows and fresh cow feces are documented at the St. David Cienega in SPRNCA (GPS points follow their respective images):
Dropped pin
Near Cochise County, AZ
1 min

Directions  Start  Save  La

Measure distance

RQ9M+V45 St David, Arizona

(31.8196279, -110.2171320)

Suggest an edit
Dropped pin
Near Cochise County, AZ

1 min

Directions Start Save

Measure distance

RQHG+PW3 St David, Arizona
(31.8292640, -110.2226916)

Suggest an edit
Dropped pin
Near Cochise County, AZ
1 min

Directions
Start
Save
Location
Measure distance

RQRF+PVC St David, Arizona

(31.8418112, -110.2253734)

Suggest an edit

Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Thursday, February 16, 2023, cows and fresh feces are documented in SPRNCA from the Hereford Bridge to three miles north:

31.4547687, -110.1105883

31.4545476, -110.1102694
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Saturday, February 18, 2023, fresh cow feces and tracks are documented in SPRNCA from near Contention City to approximately three miles north for the entire length of the survey:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Saturday, February 18, 2023, fresh cow feces and tracks are documented in SPRNCA near the San Pedro House on the eastern banks of the San Pedro along with long tracks of compacted grass, compressed mud, heavily grazed short grass with fresh feces every few hundred yards:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Thursday, February 23, 2023, fresh cow feces and tracks are documented in SPRNCA in the Contention area:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
This morning, Friday, February 24, 2023, for approximately three miles south of the San Pedro House fresh cow feces and tracks are documented on both the east and west sides of the River:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
Today, February 27, 2023, we document cows, fresh feces and tracks in SPRNCA in the St. David Cienega. Some cows have green ear tags:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, February 28, 2023, we document cows, fresh feces and tracks north of the Hereford Bridge. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid-February.”:
31.4471220, -110.10
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, February 28, 2023, we document cows, fresh feces and tracks at Fairbank including right in the yard of the Historical Site. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, where "Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well facilities sometime in the month of February" and where “She [Kathy Moreno] is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals.”:

Today, February 28, 2023, we document cows, fresh feces and tracks at Fairbank including right in the yard of the Historical Site. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, where "Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well facilities sometime in the month of February” and where “She [Kathy Moreno] is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals.”:
31.7231820, -110.1862041
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 1, 2023, we document fresh cow feces, urine and tracks in the three mile stretch of the San Pedro River in SPRNCA south from the San Pedro House:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Today, March 3, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks north of Fairbank near Contention in SPRNCA:
Today March 5, 2023, we document cows, fresh feces and tracks near St. David. We observe roughly 16 cow in two separate herds. We document a breach in a SPRNCA boundary fence with a clear cow trail extending from the adjacent private land onto SPRNCA:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 5, 2023, in SPRNCA on the east side of the River, nearby the bridge, we document a herd of approximately 12 cows, some with yellow ear tags. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid-February.”:
THESE COWS WERE IMAGED APPROXIMATELY 25 FEET FROM THE FOLLOWING IMAGE OF STOMPED GRASS:

AND A THREE MINUTE WALK FROM THIS STOMPED GRASS AND COWS ANOTHER GROUP OF COWS ARE DOCUMENTED:
Today, March 5, 2023, we document dead cows, fresh cow feces and tracks in the Fairbank area. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman reported, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Bernal... will be putting together a larger gather...sometime in the month of February. He has admin key access.” And that, “Kathy Moreno...is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...” And that, 1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks.”:

31.7286879, -110.196228

31.7350956, 110.1945294
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 7, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks south of the San Pedro House. This is the area where, according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid February 2023.”:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 8, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks north of Fairbank at Contention. This is the area where, according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, reported “1/25/23 Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well Facilities sometime in the month of February. He has admin key assess. … Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals…” … “1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks … Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals…”: 
Robin Silver, M.D.  
Co-founder and Board Member  
Center for Biological Diversity  
PO Box 1178  
Flagstaff, AZ 86002  
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org  
Phone: 602-799-3275  
FAX: 928-222-0077  
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 10, 2023, in SPRNCA we document heavy cow traffic on the east side of the River. Large swaths of habitat are soiled with fresh feces. We document cows within 100 feet of the River. The cows are both tagged and untagged. A downed fence is documented. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid-February 2023.”:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today March 10, 2023, we document cows and fresh feces at the St. David Cienega. This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that, in response to our December 23, 2022, complaint, that “…fencing should be done in a couple months.”:
31.8426445, -110.226
31.8423042, -1
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, Saturday, March 11, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks at Fairbank.

This is the area where, according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, reported “1/25/23 Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well Facilities sometime in the month of February. He has admin key assess. ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...” ... “1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...”:
31.7393853,
-110.1955670
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Yesterday, March 11, 2023, we document fresh cow tracks and sign south of the Hereford bridge on the west bank of the San Pedro River, beginning just south of the bridge and extending approximately one mile to the south.

This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid-February 2023.”:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Robin Silver

From: Robin Silver
Sent: Sunday, March 12, 2023 10:26 PM
To: BLM_TUCSON_FIELD_OFFICE (BLM_AZ_TFOWEB@blm.gov); Tracy Stone-Manning (tstonemanning@blm.gov); Nada Culver (nculver@blm.gov); Ray Suazo (rmsuazo@blm.gov); 'Dingman, Colleen J'; Scott Feldhausen (afeldhausen@blm.gov)
Cc: John Martin (john.h.martin@usdoj.gov); Martha Williams (martha_williams@fws.gov); Amy Lueders (RDLueders@fws.gov); Heather Whitlaw (Heather_Whitlaw@fws.gov); Julie McIntyre (julie.mcintyre@fws.gov); Deb Haaland (exec@ios.doi.gov); Shannon Estenoz (Shannon_Estenoz@ios.doi.gov); Rachel Kent Esq. (rachel.kent@sol.doi.gov)
Subject: SPRNCA POST SETTLEMENT TRESPASS COW COMPLAINT #50 FRESH COW FECES AND TRACKS IN SPRNCA NEAR THE SAN PEDRO HOUSE after "NEIGHBORING RANCHES ... PLANNING A GATHER ... IN MID FEBRUARY"

Today, March 12, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks near the San Pedro House. We observed one cow and a calf but were not able to capture an image.

This is the area where, according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid February 2023.”:
Today, March 14, 2023, we document cows, fresh cow feces and tracks north of Fairbank at Contention.

This is the area where, local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023, as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, reports: “1/25/23 Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well Facilities sometime in the month of February. He has admin key assess. ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals…” ... “1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals…”:

31.7997773, -110.2148860
31.8114196, -110.2121139
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 15, 2023, we document cows, fresh cow feces and tracks north of Fairbank for approximately three miles.

This is the area where, local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023, as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, reports: “1/25/23 Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well Facilities sometime in the month of February. He has admin key assess. ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...” ... “1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...”:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today March 15, 2023, we document cows and fresh feces at the St. David Cienega.

This is the area where, according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 as identified in the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, reported that “...fencing should be done in a couple months.” [from December 23, 22]:
31.8427824, -110.22
31.8423956, -11
Today, March 17, 2023, we document three large groups of cows, fresh cow feces and tracks north of the Hereford bridge.

This is the area where according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman reported, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 required by the stipulated settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid-February 2023.”:
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 17, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks near the San Pedro House.

This is the area where, according to local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman reported, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023 pursuant to the August 9, 2022, settlement agreement filed on August 9, 2022, that “Private neighboring ranches are planning a gather and working with the livestock inspector mid February 2023.”: 


Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 18, 2023, we document cows, fresh cow feces and tracks north of Fairbank at Contention.

This is the area where, local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman reports, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023, pursuant to our stipulated settlement agreement, filed on August 9, 2022, that “1/25/23 Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well Facilities sometime in the month of February. He has admin key assess. … Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals…” … “1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks … Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals…”:

(31.7904148, -110.2198970)
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org
Today, March 19, 2023, we document fresh cow feces and tracks at Fairbank.

This is the area where, local BLM Field manager Colleen Dingman reports, in her February 9, 2023, biannual report for the period of August 9, 2022 through January 31, 2023, pursuant to our stipulated settlement agreement, filed on August 9, 2022, that “1/25/23 Baker called Bernal and he will be putting together a larger gather into the Summers Well Facilities sometime in the month of February. He has admin key assess. ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...” ... “1/30 Baker talked with Rene Bernal who is planning a gather in this area in the next 2 weeks ... Kathy Moreno was called 2/1/23 and notified of location near Fairbank. She is hiring a crew for removal and is trying to get them scheduled next week 2/6/23 for removals...”: 
Robin Silver, M.D.
Co-founder and Board Member
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 1178
Flagstaff, AZ 86002
Email: rsilver@biologicaldiversity.org
Phone: 602-799-3275
FAX: 928-222-0077
WEB: www.biologicaldiversity.org