March 8, 2012

TO: Tina Campbell, Chief  
Division of Policy and Directives Management  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
4401 North Fairfax Drive, MS 2042  
Arlington, VA 22203  

RE: Comments on a draft policy on interpretation of the phrase “significant portion of its range” in the Endangered Species Act’s definitions of “endangered species” and “threatened species.”

Dear Ms. Campbell:

On behalf of our millions of members and supporters who care deeply about imperiled wildlife that depend on the nation’s forests, deserts, grasslands, oceans and other ecosystems, we write to express our concerns with the draft policy on interpretation of the phrase “significant portion of its range” ("SPOIR") proposed by U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS) and National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS). The Endangered Species Act defines an endangered species as “any species which is in danger of extinction throughout all or a significant portion of its range” and a threatened species as “any species which is likely to become an endangered species within the foreseeable future throughout all or a significant portion of its range.” The language of these definitions, the legislative history, recent case law, and the draft policy itself all make clear that a species need not be at risk of worldwide extinction to qualify for Endangered Species Act protection. Rather, as noted in the draft policy, a species can qualify as an endangered species in two ways: if it is in danger of extinction “throughout all of its range,” or if it is in danger of extinction “in a significant portion of its range.” In enacting this provision, Congress intended to provide a means to protect species before they are on the brink of extinction, which is of paramount importance to species conservation.

The previous policy developed by the Solicitor of the Department of the Interior ran afoul of the ESA’s statutory language, and we supported its withdrawal. We have serious concerns, however, about provisions of the draft policy—specifically: (1) the proposed definition of “significant,” which specifies that a portion of range can be considered significant only if loss of the species from that portion would threaten the species as a whole with extinction, and (2) the determination that lost historic range cannot qualify as a significant portion of range.

The draft policy specifies that a “portion of the range of a species is ‘significant’ if its contribution to the viability of the species is so important that without that portion, the species

---

would be in danger of extinction." This definition does not provide a meaningful distinction between when a species is endangered or threatened in a SPOIR and when a species is imperiled throughout all its range, and will severely limit protection for species that are imperiled in significant portions of their ranges. Indeed, this definition of significance has already formed the basis for denying protection to the cactus ferruginous pygmy-owl despite the fact that it is indisputably imperiled in the Sonoran Desert, which FWS itself determined is important to the representation, redundancy and resiliency of the species.

Moreover, we believe this draft policy definition does not truly solve the redundancy problem identified by the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals in Defenders of Wildlife v. Norton, 258 F.3d 1136 (9th Cir. 2001). In Defenders, the appellate court held that “[i]f … the effect of extinction throughout ‘a significant portion of its range’ is the threat of extinction everywhere, then the threat of extinction throughout ‘a significant portion of its range’ is equivalent to the threat of extinction throughout all its range.” Id. at 1141. Although worded differently, it seems that, in effect, the Services have again collapsed the two paths to species’ protection mandated by Congress. See 76 Fed. Reg. at 77,003 (conceding that, “[u]nder most circumstances, … the outcomes of [the agencies’] status determinations with or without the draft policy would be the same”).

The draft policy emphasizes “the biological importance of the portion to the conservation of the species as the measure” for determining when a portion can be considered significant, using “the concepts of redundancy, resiliency, and representation.” We support using these concepts to evaluate the significance of portions of range, but the threshold for determining this importance cannot be set as high as the risk of extinction to the species as a whole. Instead, portions of range that meaningfully contribute to the species in terms of its redundancy, resiliency, and representation should be considered significant. Please consider this alternative approach.

The draft policy further specifies that when considering whether a species is endangered in a SPOIR, the range that will be considered is “the general geographical area within which that species can be found at the time FWS or NMFS makes any particular status determination,” and more directly that lost historical range “cannot constitute a significant portion of a species’ range.” Under this policy, past losses of species are effectively ignored unless they compromise the viability of the species in its current range, making determinations of the need to protect species arbitrarily dependent on when the agencies consider the status of a species. This approach leads to a temporally shifting baseline, which has long been recognized as problematic by conservation scientists. We do not contend that lost historic range automatically means a

---

3 76 Fed. Reg. at 77,002.
5 76 Fed. Reg. at 76,993.
species must be protected under the Endangered Species Act, but rather that, as with current range, the agencies should analyze whether areas of lost range are needed to ensure redundancy, resiliency, and representation of the species.

We are further concerned that the proposed SPOIR policy is inconsistent with the urgent need to ensure that species have sufficient habitat and adaptability to weather changes in their environment ongoing and predicted under climate change, which will undoubtedly have consequences on the range of imperiled species. Therefore, it is essential that a SPOIR not be restrictive, but rather allow for broad protections to the full range of habitats occupied by species, some of which will undoubtedly provide climate refugia and thereby ensure their survival.

As acknowledged in the draft policy, protecting species because they are endangered in significant portions of their ranges “may lead to application of the protections of the Act in areas in which a species is not currently endangered or threatened with extinction.”8 To address this issue while at the same time avoiding exposing more species to the risk of extinction, we agree with the Services that they have the discretion “to implement the Act, where possible, to avoid or minimize expending resources on actions that either do not address threats that led to the species warranting listing or do not advance recovery of the species.”9

Sincerely,

Noah Greenwald
Endangered Species Program Director
Center for Biological Diversity

Leda Huta
Executive Director
Endangered Species Coalition

Patti Goldman
Vice President of Litigation
Earthjustice

Ralph Henry
Deputy Director, Animal Protection Litigation
The Humane Society of the United States

Corry Westbrook
Federal Policy Director
Oceana

---

8 76 Fed. Reg. at 76,992.
9 Id.
Regina Asmutis-Silvia  
Senior Biologist  
Whale and Dolphin Conservation Society  

Connie Hanson  
Director  
Christians Caring for Creation (CCC)  

Sarina Jepsen  
Endangered Species Program Director  
The Xerces Society for Invertebrate Conservation  
Sean Cosgrove  

Sean Cosgrove  
Ocean Campaign Director  
Conservation Law Foundation  

Linda Krop  
Chief Counsel  
Environmental Defense Center  

Jeff Ruch  
Executive Director  
Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility (PEER)  

Steve Pederey  
Conservation Director  
Oregon Wild  

Duane Short  
Wild Species Program Director  
Biodiversity Conservation Alliance  

Dave Werntz  
Science and Conservation Director  
Conservation Northwest  

Cathy Liss  
President  
Animal Welfare Institute  

Andrew J. Orahoske  
Conservation Director  
Environmental Protection Information Center
Ben Prater  
Conservation Director  
Wild South

Jon Marvel  
Executive Director  
Western Watersheds Project

Bruce McIntosh  
Staff Ecologist  
Western Nebraska Resources Council

Jennifer Schwartz  
Staff Attorney  
Hells Canyon Preservation Council

Mark Salvo  
Wildlife Program Director  
WildEarth Guardians

Paul Todd  
Program Manager  
International Fund for Animal Welfare

Tracy Coppola, J.D., M.S.  
Program Associate  
Born Free USA

Ben Schreiber  
Climate and Energy Tax Analyst  
Friends of the Earth

Chris Irwin  
President  
United Mountain Defense

Bill Matturro  
Founder  
Protect All Living Species

Cheryl Johncox  
Executive Director  
Buckeye Forest Council
Jim Scheff  
Director  
Kentucky Heartwood  

Tim Keating  
Executive Director  
Rainforest Relief  

Christine Ellis  
Waccamaw RIVERKEEPER  

Ernie Reed  
Council Chair  
Heartwood  

David Orr  
Protect Arkansas Wildlife  

Patrick Moore  
Legislative Director  
Coastal Conservation League  

Dan Silver  
Executive Director  
Endangered Habitats League  

Scot Quaranda  
Campaign Director  
Dogwood Alliance  

Kelly Burke  
Executive Director  
Grand Canyon Wildlands Council  

D. Bruce Means  
President and Executive Director  
Coastal Plains Institute and Land Conservancy  

Nancy Stranahan  
Director  
The Arc of Appalachia Preserve System  

Steve Brooks  
Director  
The Clinch Coalition
Timothy J Coleman  
Executive Director  
Kettle Range Conservation Group

Melinda Hughes-Wert  
President  
Nature Abounds

Todd Steiner  
Executive Director  
Turtle Island Restoration Network

Mary Camp  
President  
Deer Creek Valley Natural Resources Conservation Association

Judith Rodd  
Director  
Friends of Blackwater

Mark Shelley  
Director  
Southern Appalachian Forest Coalition

Veronica Egan  
Executive Director  
Great Old Broads for Wilderness

Chad Hanson, Ph.D.  
Director  
John Muir Project

Jeff Petersen  
Executive Director  
Fund for Wild Nature

Ellen Rendulich  
Director  
Citizens Against Ruining the Environment

Dan Randolph  
San Juan Citizens Alliance

Chris Matera, P.E.  
Founder
Massachusetts Forest Watch
Sloan Shoemaker
Executive Director
Wilderness Workshop

Josh Pollack
Conservation Director
Rocky Mountain Wild

Bob Gale
Ecologist & Public Lands Director
Western North Carolina Alliance

Brent Plater
Executive Director
Wild Equity Institute

Jorge Andromidas
Director
Colorado Grizzly Project

Spencer Lennard
Director
Big Wildlife

Elizabeth Hurst-Waitz
Chapter President
Central New Mexico Audubon Society

Bob Sallinger
Conservation Director
Audubon Society of Portland

Josh Laughlin
Conservation Director
Cascadia Wildlands

Bethanie Walder
Executive Director
Wildlands CPR

Cynthia Sarthou
Executive Director
Gulf Restoration Network
Stan Kotala, M.D.
Conservation Chair
Juniata Valley Audubon

Gary Bobker
Program Director
The Bay Institute

Olivia Schmidt
Program Director
Bark

Michael J. Painter
Coordinator
Californians for Western Wilderness

Scott Greacen
Executive Director
Friends of the Eel River

Daniel Hall
Director, Market Solutions
ForestEthics

Brent Fenty
Executive Director
Oregon Natural Desert Association

Katie Tripp, Ph.D.
Director of Science and Conservation
Save the Manatee Club

Marydele Donnelly
Director of International Policy
Sea Turtle Conservancy

Kim McCreery, Ph.D.
Regional Director/Staff Scientist
New Mexico Wilderness Alliance

Tom Huhnerkoch
Director
Mountain Cats Trust
Matt Schwartz  
Executive Director  
South Florida Wildlands Association

Brooks Fahy  
Executive Director  
Predator Defense

Javier Biaggi  
President  
Sociedad Protectora de la Vida Silvestre de Puerto Rico

Wally Sykes  
Co-Founder  
NE Oregon Ecosystems

Catherine Eastman  
Conservationist  
Vilano Marine Turtle Patrol  
Crescent Beach Turtle Patrol

Dave Holaway, President  
White Mountain Conservation League

David Wade  
Director  
Endangered Small Animal Conservation Fund

Jennifer Bock  
Water Director  
High Country Citizens' Alliance

Camilla H. Fox  
Executive Director  
Project Coyote

Anja Heister  
Footloose Montana

Elliott A. Norse, PhD  
President  
Marine Conservation Institute
Kevin Reuther
Legal Director
Minnesota Center for Environmental Advocacy

Maggie Howell
Managing Director
Wolf Conservation Center

Oscar Simpson
Chair
New Mexico Sportsmen

Beth Allgood Blalock
General Counsel
Georgia Conservancy

David R. Parsons
Carnivore Conservation Biologist
The Rewilding Institute